

In many ways, then, the book's weakness is also its greatest strength. Van Dam's trilogy is the first comprehensive treatment of the province of Cappadocia and thus also the first synthetic examination of all the Cappadocian fathers from all possible perspectives. There is simply no way to have put together such varied and rich material without some overlap, some predilection for the viewpoint of the sources, and some painting with broad brushstrokes. I for one am extremely grateful for the wealth of material Van Dam has assembled, the care and intricacy with which he has arranged it, and the style and grace with which he has put it into prose.

NOEL LENSKI  
*University of Colorado at Boulder*

Clarence Gallagher, *Church Law and Church Order in Rome and Byzantium: A Comparative Study*, Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs 8, Aldershot: Ashgate Variorum, 2002, Pp.xi + 279. £47.50. ISBN 0-7546-0685-6.

One of the outcomes of the division of Christianity into distinct churches in late antiquity and the early middle ages is the formation of different traditions of canon law which, despite common ground, are seldom studied by a single writer in a specialized monograph. *Church Law and Church Order in Rome and Byzantium* is one exception, a book which deals with nine collections of canon law compiled in various parts of the Christian world from the sixth century to the thirteenth. For each of these collections the author describes the historical and especially the theological and ecclesiastical context, the biography of the compiler (whenever this is possible), and the sources of law used in his work. Then follows a detailed discussion of the way each of these collections treats three issues which are still relevant for every Christian church: church government, divorce and remarriage, and clerical celibacy. This approach enables the author (and the reader) to assess the relative importance both of the common ground shared by all churches and of the rules and practices which are peculiar to only some of them. The author's conclusion is that there has never been complete unity in church discipline and that divergent rules and practices on various matters often antedate theological disputes and schisms.

Chapter 1 deals with two sixth-century collections, the so-called *Dionysiana*, compiled in Rome by Dionysius Exiguus, probably under Pope Hormisdas (514–23), and the *Synagoga in Fifty Titles* of John Scholasticus, Patriarch of Constantinople (565–77). Chapter 2, which brings us to the ninth century, discusses the *Nomokanon in Fourteen Titles*, which Gallagher considers 'the official compendium of canon law' of the Church of Constantinople, and the Frankish forgery known as the *False Decretals*, described as 'one of the most daring and successful frauds in history'. Chapter 3 deals with the juridical works of Methodios (815–85) and especially with his Old Slavonic adaptation of the *Synagoga in Fifty Titles*. The following chapters are dedicated to two twelfth-century canonists whose works exercised an outstanding influence on the subsequent evolution of canon law in their respective churches: Gratian of Bologna, author of the *Concordia Discordantium Canonum*, and Theodore Balsamon, who wrote commentaries on the *Nomokanon in Fourteen Titles* and the chronological collection of conciliar canons and canons of the fathers of the church. In his discussion of Gratian's work, Gallagher makes use of recent research on the manuscript tradition of this important text (A. Winroth, *The Making of Gratian's Decretum* [Cambridge, 2000])

which has demonstrated that the shorter version once considered an abbreviation of the original is itself the original. This innovation is all the more important because this shorter and earlier version is free of the prolixity and lack of clarity for which Gratian has traditionally been criticized. The works which form the subject of Chapter 6 were written by two Christians who lived under Muslim rule in the thirteenth century, Bar-Hebraeus and Ebedjesus. The first, a prelate of the Jacobite Church, is the author of a canonical work known as the *Book of Directives* which is remarkable for its extended use of Muslim law. The second, a bishop of the East Syrian Church, was a prolific writer whose output includes a *Collection of Synodical Canons* and a *Regulation of Ecclesiastical Judgments and Laws*. Ebedjesus is of special interest for the scope of Gallagher's research; though his church had developed outside the Roman Empire, his works have much in common with the rest of the canonical traditions examined in this monograph. The conclusion is followed by four appendices. The first of these will be useful for those unable to read John Scholasticus' *Synagoga* in the original Greek, for it offers an English translation of the headers of the titles and then indicates the individual canons included in each of them. A parallel column indicates which canons were taken by Methodios in his Old Slavonic adaptation. The appendices are followed by the bibliography, which is incomplete, as it does not include all the items referred to in the footnotes (e.g., pp.164–5 n.40), and an index.

Scholars wishing to learn something about canonical traditions with which they are not familiar will no doubt find this monograph useful provided that they consult it with caution, for it is unfortunately not free from occasional omissions and inaccuracies. For example, to assert that prior to John Scholasticus 'there were canonical collections but there is no information about them' (pp.20–21) is to overlook E. Schwartz's 'Die Kanonensammlungen der alten Kirche' (*Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung, Kanonistische Abteilung*, 25 [1936], pp.1–114 = *Gesammelte Schriften* 4 [Berlin, 1960], pp.159–275). This fundamental study deals with canonical collections which circulated both in the Greek East and in the Latin West before the Council of Chalcedon (451) and especially with a Syriac translation from 500/501 CE of an otherwise lost Greek collection (ed. F. Schulthess, *Die syrische Kanones der Synoden von Nicaea bis Chalcedon*, *Abhandlungen der königlichen Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen*, N.F., 10[2] [1908]) which was used at that council. As for John Scholasticus himself, his authorship of the *Collection in Eighty-Seven Chapters*, a series of excerpts from Justinian's *Novels* on ecclesiastical affairs (ed. G.E. Heimbach, *Anekdotai*, 2 [Leipzig, 1840; reprint Aalen, 1969], pp.202–37) is taken for granted (p.22), though there is nothing certain about it. According to Gallagher (pp.44–5), the 882/3 CE revision of the *Nomokanon in Fourteen Titles* 'is known as the *Nomokanon of Photios*, and the preface is attributed to him, though there is little evidence that the patriarch had himself anything directly to do with the edition'. In fact, few manuscripts of the *Nomokanon* attribute it to Photius (Patriarch of Constantinople, 858–67; 877–86), and their testimony is considered doubtful on this matter. Moreover, in an article published some years ago, B.H. Stolte argued convincingly that the 882/3 CE revision of the *Nomokanon* cannot be attributed to Photius because its provisions on the ordination of bishops differ substantially from those included in the *Eisagoge*, a contemporary law compendium in which Photius is known to have been involved ('A Note on the Un-Photian Revision of the *Nomocanon XIV Titulorum*', in S. Troianos (ed.), *Analekta Atheniensia ad Ius Byzantinum Spectantia* [Athens, 1997], pp.115–30).

In some other instances, regrettable mistakes have found their way into the text, though they are certainly not due to a lack of knowledge on the part of the author. Thus the date of 280 CE is given for the persecution of Emperor Diocletian (p.9), who only

became emperor in 284, while the persecution itself began in 303; the title of the second edition of the *Code* of Justinian is twice given as *Codex Repetitae Lectionis* (pp.19 and 21) rather than *Codex Repetitae Praelectionis*; the fifth-century text generally known as the *Syro-Roman Lawbook* is said to be known also in Greek (p.195 n.30).

Despite the considerable number of omissions and inaccuracies, some of which have been pointed out here, this comparative study in church discipline and canon law is recommended to all scholars in the field. It may be hoped that some of them will imitate its approach in their own research.

AVSHALOM LANIADO  
Tel Aviv University

Yitzhak Hen (ed.), *De Sion exhibit lex et verbum domini de Hierusalem: Essays on Medieval Law, Liturgy, and Literature in Honour of Amnon Linder*, Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages 1, Turnhout: Brepols, 2001, Pp.viii +214. ISBN 2-503-51091-4.

This volume contains 13 articles by colleagues, students, and friends of Amnon Linder presented to him on his retirement from teaching at the Hebrew University. The scope of the collection reflects Linder's wide learning, primarily his interest in legal history, the Holy Land and holy places, Christian-Jewish relations, and medieval liturgy. A list of Linder's publications appears at the end. The richness of the volume precludes exhaustive comment on each paper. What follows is a brief reference to its themes, beginning with liturgy.

Editor Yitzhak Hen's 'Educating the Clergy: Canon Law and Liturgy in a Carolingian Handbook' focuses on the liturgical and educational requisites of Charlemagne's ecclesiastical reforms. It analyzes a ninth-century liturgical-canonical manuscript from Fleury and establishes its place in the education and indoctrination of the Carolingian clergy. Michael Goodich's 'Liturgy and the Foundation of Cults in the Thirteenth and Fourteenth Centuries' reveals the role of liturgy in the transmission of Christian values through an examination of the establishment of the cult of Thomas of Hereford in the late thirteenth century. Bat-Sheva Albert's article underscores the old anti-Arian and new anti-Jewish doctrinal messages in the Visigoth liturgy of the seventh century. These three papers illustrate the centrality of liturgy in medieval spirituality, a theme brilliantly conveyed in Linder's most recent publication *Raising Arms: Liturgy in the Struggle to Liberate Jerusalem in the Late Middle Ages* (Turnhout, 2003).

This evokes a second theme: the Holy Land and holy spaces. Ora Limor offers an inventive reading of two letters, one of the pilgrim Egeria and one of St. Jerome, and unravels the early ways of transforming biblical-historical sites into Christian sacred spaces. David Jacoby's article also studies the process of making a place holy. His examination of the mid-thirteenth-century manuscript *Pardouns d'Acre* maps the establishment of institutionalized pilgrimage in crusader Acre and the attempt to incorporate Acre into a sacred Christian space. A typological analysis of multi-creed sacred spaces is introduced in the article by B.Z. Kedar. This typology accounts for the spatial and liturgical convergences occurring in holy places of the Mediterranean region, with the Greek convent of Our Lady of Saydnaya offering a noteworthy case study of such convergences.

Copyright of Mediterranean Historical Review is the property of Frank Cass & Company Ltd. and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.